Northward extent of East Asian monsoon covaries with intensity on orbital and millennial timescales

Yonaton Goldsmith1,2, Wallace S. Broecker1, Hai Xu3,4, Pratigya J. Polissar1, Peter B. deMenocal1, Naomi Porat2, Jianghu Lan5, Peng Cheng5, Weijian Zhou6, and Zhisheng An1

1 Lamont–Doherty Earth Observatory, Columbia University, Palisades, NY 10964; 2 State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi’an 710061, Shaanxi, China; and 3 Geological Survey of Israel, Jerusalem 95501, Israel

Edited by Jeffrey P. Severinghaus, Scripps Institution of Oceanography, La Jolla, CA, and approved December 28, 2016 (received for review October 7, 2016)

The magnitude, rate, and extent of past and future East Asian monsoon (EAM) rainfall fluctuations remain unresolved. Here, late Pleistocene–Holocene EAM rainfall intensity is reconstructed using a well-dated northeastern China closed-basin lake area record located at the modern northwestern fringe of the EAM. The EAM intensity and northern extent alternated rapidly between wet and dry periods on time scales of centuries. Lake levels were 60 m higher than present during the early and middle Holocene, requiring a twofold increase in annual rainfall, which, based on modern rainfall distribution, requires a ~400 km northward expansion/migration of the EAM. The lake record is highly correlated with both northern and southern Chinese cave deposit isotope records, supporting rainfall “intensity based” interpretations of these deposits as opposed to an alternative “water vapor sourcing” interpretation. These results indicate that EAM intensity and the northward extent covary on orbital and millennial timescales. The termination of wet conditions at 5.5 ka BP (~35 m lake drop) triggered a large cultural collapse of Early Neolithic cultures in north China, and possibly promoted the emergence of complex societies of the Late Neolithic.

Significance

The magnitude, rate, and extent of past and future East Asian monsoon (EAM) rainfall fluctuations remain unresolved. Here, we present a rainfall reconstruction based on the surface area of a closed-basin lake located at the modern northwestern boundary of the EAM. Our record shows that fluctuations of EAM intensity and spatial extent covaried over the past 125 ka. This record contributes to the resolution of a current controversy concerning the response of the EAM to external climatic forcings. We propose that a substantial decrease in rainfall at 5.5 ka was a major factor leading to a large cultural collapse of the Early Neolithic culture in north China.
The results show that the lake fluctuated on both orbital and millennial time scales. The lake reached highstands at 123 ± 13 ka (marine isotope stage 5e), 58 ± 5 ka (between marine isotope stages 3 and 4), and 11–5.5 ka (marine isotope stage 1) (Figs. 2 and 3). These three major highstands occurred during periods of high boreal summer insolation, indicating that the intensity/extent of the EAM is governed by summer insolation intensity. Erosion and burial result in scarce pre-Holocene shoreline evidence; therefore, additional highstands cannot be excluded.

During the Late Glacial (16–11.5 ka) the lake fluctuated on millennial time scales, with the Bølling–Allerød (B–A) and Younger Dryas periods having high and low lake levels, respectively (Fig. 2). These abrupt fluctuations occurred during times of relatively low insolation and are coeval with Greenland and circum-North Atlantic records, indicating that the EAM responded to climatic forcings that originated in the North Atlantic through teleconnections most likely related to shifts in the position of the thermal equator (15) and the associated shifts in the westerlies position (10).

Lake levels during the Early and Middle Holocene were overall high, corresponding to the Early Middle Holocene summer (June–August; JJA) insolation maxima. The onset (~60 m rise in 400 y) and termination (~35 m drop in 1 ka) of the Holocene humid period occurred rapidly. During four intervals in the Early and Middle Holocene (11.5–11, 10.5–9.5, 8.3–7.8, and 6.1–5.9 ka), lake levels were particularly high, with lake drops occurring between these intervals. These millennial fluctuations appear in
both north China lake (16) and sea surface temperature records (17); their cause is not clear at this time.

**Discussion**

The main point of contention over the interpretation of the Chinese cave deposit isotope records is whether the isotopic composition of precipitation in China ($\delta^{18}P$) is correlated with the amount of local rainfall over China. To evaluate whether the Chinese cave deposits represent actual rainfall amounts, we compare the Lake Dali record to two cave deposit records from north (Lianhua Cave located ∼600 km south of Lake Dali; ref. 18) and south China (Dongge Cave located ∼1,500 km south of Lianhua Cave; ref. 19; Fig. 1).

The results show that Lake Dali lake-level history is negatively correlated with both cave records on both precessional and millennial time scales ($r^2 = 0.8$ and 0.7 for Lianhua and Dongge, respectively) (Fig. 3 and Fig. S3). High Lake Dali levels correspond with depleted Chinese cave deposits isotopic compositions and vice versa. These results indicate that to first order, the isotopic composition of precipitation is correlated with local rainfall amount over northern China and that both are regulated by EAM intensity.

The great advantage of closed-basin lakes is the quantitative constrains they can provide on paleo-rainfall amounts through a lake hydrological model. At equilibrium (stable lake level), the amount of water evaporating from the lake surface matches the inflow into the lake, which is calculated as the fraction of precipitation in the catchment that enters the lake as runoff multiplied by the catchment area of the lake and precipitation amount (20). To constrain the model, we first investigated the modern lake using satellite imagery, lake and stream chemistry, and long-term measurements of precipitation, air temperature, and evaporation (SI Materials and Methods). The results show that modern Lake Dali is a closed-basin lake at steady state, which allows us to use a closed-basin lake model and derive the essential modern hydrological parameters (e.g., lake evaporation and fraction of runoff).

To model the paleohydrology of the lake during the Holocene humid period and during the B–A, we used a digital elevation model to reconstruct the area of the lake based on the reconstructed lake level and a range of plausible lake evaporation rates using the Penman evaporation equation (21) and temperature reconstructions from the Chinese Sea (22) and climate models (23). To constrain the fraction of catchment runoff that enters the lake we used the Budyko relationship, which is an empirical model that relates the runoff fraction (rainfall/runoff) with precipitation amounts (24, 25). Our results show that annual precipitation during the early Holocene highstands must have been about double the present value for this lake basin (Fig. 4A). Because the lake likely overflowed during this time, this value...

---

**Fig. 3.** Lake Dali lake level vs. cave $\delta^{18}O_c$. (A) Smoothed $\delta^{18}O_c$ Lianhua (red curve, 5-point average) and Dongge (black, 10-point average), and Lake Dali lake level (orange). (B) Correlation between Lianhua $\delta^{18}O_c$ and Lake Dali lake level. (C) Correlation between Dongge $\delta^{18}O_c$ and Lake Dali lake level. Light-blue bars represent highstands of the lake.

---

**Fig. 4.** Rainfall reconstructions. (A) The Holocene humid period (blue lines) and B–A (green lines) hydrologic scenarios calculated using a combination of a closed-basin lake model with the Budyko relation between precipitation amount and runoff fraction (blue and green shaded squares). The solid lines are for no change in evaporation rate, and the dashed lines include changes in evaporation rate calculated using the Penman equation (SI Materials and Methods). The range of general circulation model (GCM) precipitation values for the Mid-Holocene humid period is shown in the shaded blue band (SI Materials and Methods; Table S5). The modern rainfall and fraction of runoff is shown for comparison (black line). (B) East Asian modern rainfall distribution (shaded) (data from the Global Precipitations Climatology Centre, www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/data/gridded/data.gpcc.html). A doubling of rainfall during the Early and Middle Holocene (from 400 to 800 mm/yr) requires an ∼400 km northward shift of the 800 mm isohyet.
should be regarded as a minimum estimate. Sustaining the B–A lake level would require 160–170% of modern precipitation values (Fig. 4; SI Materials and Methods). Based on the modern spatial distribution of rainfall in China, a doubling of rainfall (from 400 to 800 mm/y) would require an ~400 km northwestern movement of the 800-mm isohyet (Fig. 4B). Higher lake levels during the B–A, Middle and Early Holocene are most likely the outcome of two processes, the overall intensification of the EAM (as represented by the Chinese cave records), and a northwestern expansion of the monsoon. Assessing the proportional contribution of both processes is not possible at this time due to the lack of quantitative rainfall reconstructions from the central region of the EAM.

We compared our reconstructions of precipitation amount and the inferred northward extension of the EAM during the Holocene humid period to the 6-ka simulations from 12 paleoclimate modeling intercomparison project phase 3 (PMIP3) and National Center for Atmospheric Research (NCAR) general circulation models. Eleven of thirteen models accurately capture the northward EAM expansion. However, annual precipitation estimates from these simulations underestimate the magnitude of northern China hydrological change by 50% (Fig. 4) (see SI Materials and Methods, Fig. S4, Table S5, and ref. 26 for details of the method).

Our results suggest the abrupt termination of the Holocene humid period at 5.5–5 ka had dramatic impacts on the social development of Chinese culture. At this time, a major cultural transition occurred in north and central China identified by the disappearance of Early Neolithic cultures (Hongshan culture in North China, which existed from 6.5 to 5 ka, and Yangshao culture in central China which existed from 7 to 5 ka) (27). In central China, Early Neolithic cultures were replaced by stratified and socially and politically complex Late Neolithic cultures (e.g., Longshan culture that existed from 5 to 3.9 ka) (27), and previously unoccupied areas on the eastern margin of the Tibetan plateau were populated (28). In contrast, northeast China experienced a sharp population decline represented by the Xiaoyehuan culture, which existed between 5 and 4.2 ka (27, 29). The sharp decline of north China rainfall amounts as recorded in Lake Dali, may have triggered contrasting reorganizations of north and central China cultures, causing a rapid population collapse in northern China and promoting structured complex societies in central China.

Materials and Methods
Lake beach ridges identified using satellite images and an ASTER digital elevation model were mapped in the field; stratigraphic relations were evaluated and samples were collected for dating. Thirty-six shell and charcoal samples were dated using conventional radiocarbon methods. Analysis of modern lake water samples showed that there is no old radiocarbon in the lake. Nine sediment samples were dated using conventional OSL methods.

The hydrological model combines a closed-basin mass balance equation with the Budyko relationship, which is an empirical model that relates runoff fraction with precipitation amount and the Penman equation to quantify lake evaporation. The percent rainfall increase between modern and lake highstand, calculated using the hydrological model, was compared with the 6-ka simulations from 12 PMIP3 and NCAR general circulation models.

17. An Z, Sun Y, Chang H, Zhang P, Liu X (2014) Holocene humid period to the 6-ka simulations from 12 paleoclimate modeling intercomparison project phase 3 (PMIP3) and National Center for Atmospheric Research (NCAR) general circulation models. Eleven of thirteen models accurately capture the northward EAM expansion. However, annual precipitation estimates from these simulations underestimate the magnitude of northern China hydrological change by 50% (Fig. 4) (see SI Materials and Methods, Fig. S4, Table S5, and ref. 26 for details of the method).